

# **DIFFERENTIATED CITIZENSHIP: GOVERNING POPULATIONS BEYOND TERRITORIAL STATE BORDERS**

Lecturers from University of Bergen (UiB):

**Synnøve Bendixsen**, Postdoctoral fellow in social anthropology

**Randi Gressgård**, Associate Professor of gender studies

**Donna McCormack**, Postdoctoral fellow in gender studies

Invited guest lecturers:

**Amanda Gouws**, Professor of political science, University of Stellenbosch, South Africa

**Umut Erel**, Lecturer in sociology, Open University, UK

**Tina Jensen**, Senior Researcher, The Danish National Centre for Social Research (SFI), Denmark

**Helle Rydstrom**, Professor of gender studies, Lund University, Sweden

Collaborators:

**Kari Jegerstedt**, Associate Professor of gender studies

**Gaudencia Mutema**, Senior Researcher in gender studies

**Gilda Seddighi**, PhD scholar in gender and media studies

This interdisciplinary course will explore how economic, political and cultural processes of globalization have blurred national boundaries in ways that challenge state sovereignty and universal citizenship models. It will give students insight into the ways in which nation states are responding to globalization through rigid migration politics, stricter border control and extensive policies of securitization, while at the same time safeguarding the circulation of people, goods and services in a global market. Students will be introduced to both theoretical and methodological challenges from juridical, anthropological, cultural and sociological perspectives, using various feminist, gender and postcolonial theories.

## **Course description**

This interdisciplinary course will explore how economic, political and cultural processes of globalization have blurred the boundaries between inside and outside nation states – between an internal ‘we’ and an external ‘them’ – in ways that profoundly challenge state sovereignty and universal citizenship models. This course will give students insight into the ways in which many nation states are responding to globalization and the waning of sovereignty through a more rigid migration politics, stricter border control and extensive policies of securitization, while at the same time safeguarding the circulation of people, goods and services to increase economic competitiveness in a global market. Students will explore issues concerning the dependence of economic growth on a high level of gendered labour mobility that produces – and gives legitimacy to – extensive securitization and stricter border control. Students will be introduced to both theoretical and methodological challenges involved in gender-related research on these issues, from theoretical/philosophical, juridical, anthropological and sociological perspectives, using various feminist/gender and postcolonial theories. Specifically they will concentrate on how circulatory flows draw on pre-existing gender relations that target cheap and flexible female workers. To the extent that questions of gender

and sexuality are considered at all in discussions of differentiated citizenship, it is merely as an ‘effect’ of global transformations. Rather than taking gender and sexuality as simply derivative, this course sees it as co-constitutive with citizenship.

## **Goals and objectives**

This interdisciplinary course will provide a general theoretical introduction to the conditions of differentiated citizenship in a globalized and postcolonial context. It will be followed by in-depth analyses of the various ways in which the increased marketization of people and their bodies is played out in specific geo-political contexts: South-East Asia, Southern Africa, Eastern Europe/EU and South-America. The main aim of the course is to enable students to achieve a critical understanding of how the differentiation of citizenship entitlements serves to ensure a flexible, compatible economy by privileging certain populations, while preventing others from obtaining the same rights and entitlements.

We will read texts from the fields of political theory/philosophy, feminist/gender studies, social anthropology, postcolonial and globalization studies, literature and cinema studies, sociology, migration studies and critical race theory in order to address how gendered and hierarchical detachments of entitlement from political membership entail a fragmentation of citizenship. This interdisciplinary approach will guide students through key concepts to enhance understandings of the relationship between citizenship, the human and capital in a global, comparative context. Group discussions, doctoral presentations and film discussions will provide students with an interactive framework in which to locate the content of the course. This enquiry-based learning will enable students to work with their individual projects and to interrogate the contribution of different disciplines to better understand new forms of differentiated citizenship in current and changing global power matrices.

## **Paper instructions etc.**

The course welcomes PhD students from different professional and disciplinary backgrounds related to the fields of governance, citizenship and gender.

Most reading material will be available on My Space prior to the course, but some texts (which cannot be read online) will be handed out during the course.

Student presentations will be set during the course.

Students are required to attend all sessions of the course, and participation is also mandatory in the plenary events of the overall programme of BSRS 2014.

After the course, students are expected to present a written assignment of 15–20 pages (6000–8000 words) in English, utilizing the course curriculum. ***Deadline for paper submission is 15 September 2014.***

The papers will be awarded as A (approved) and F (not approved) by the course instructors. In order to be approved, the paper is expected to meet the standards of publishable articles in peer reviewed journals. Students whose papers are not approved will have the opportunity to

revise and resubmit. The deadline for resubmission will be specified by the course leader and announced on My Space and by email.

10 ECTS will be awarded upon successful participation of the full programme, including submission of the research paper. 3 ECTS will be awarded for participation without paper submission.

### Course outline

1. Introduction with overarching themes (23 June, 1300-1530)  
**Synnøve Bendixsen, Randi Gressgård and Donna McCormack**
2. Student introduction (23 June, 1600-1700)
3. Focus on South-America: Conceptions of race and gender (24 June, 1030-1200)  
**Tina Jensen**  
Required reading (RR): Goldstein (1999)
4. Focus on Southeast Asia: War, gendered corporeality and memories (24 June, 1300-1630)  
**Helle Rydstrøm**  
RR: Rydstrøm (2012)  
  
Film: *Sandy Lives* (90 m)  
Original Title: *Doi Cat*  
Released: 1999  
Country: Vietnam  
Director: Nguyen Thanh Van  
Language: Vietnamese  
Genre: Drama  
Theme: War and Military  
Link: <http://asiapacificfilms.com/films/search?keyword=vietnamese>
5. Focus on Southeast Asia: Social movements, civil society and the late-socialist state (25 June, 1030-1200)  
**Helle Rydstrøm**  
RR: Eto (2012)
6. Focus on EU/Eastern Europe: Migrant mothers as citizens (25 June, 1300-1630)  
**Umut Erel**  
RR: Erel (2011)
7. Focus on Scandinavia: Migration politics and the welfare state (26 June, 1030-1200)  
**Tina Jensen**  
RR: Jensen (2010)
8. Focus on EU/Eastern Europe: Gender and transnationalism (27 June, 1030-1200)  
**Umut Erel**  
RR: Lutz (2010); Mahler and Pessar (2006)

9. Film screening with open discussion (27 June, 1300-1630)

Title: *Dirty Pretty Things* (97m)

Released: 2002

Country: UK

Director: Stephen Frears

Language: English

Genre: Drama/Thriller

*Dirty Pretty Things tells the story of Okwe's (Chiwetel Ejiofor) work life as an illegal immigrant who drives a taxi by day and is a hotel receptionist at night, and his growing intimacy with Senay (Audrey Tautou), a Turkish asylum seeker who cleans at the same hotel. Centered on Okwe's discovery of a healthy human heart in a hotel toilet, the film reveals that the hotel manager, Señor Juan (Sergi Lopez), is enabling his illegal workforce to donate their healthy organs to rich, dying clients in exchange for forged European passports. What unfolds is a network of vulnerability where sex work, precarious migrations, and organ trafficking are intimately tied together. Dirty Pretty Things renders visible not only varying levels of global inequalities and migrations, but also the centrality of illegal labour and the trade in flesh to the British economy, health care system, and society in general.*

10. Irregular migration and the question of citizenship (30 June, 1030-1200)

**Synnøve Bendixsen**

RR: Bendixsen (2013); McNevin (2006)

11. Student presentations with comments from the instructors (30 June, 1300-1630)

**Synnøve Bendixsen, Randi Gressgård, Kari Jegerstedt, Donna McCormack and Gaudencia Mutema**

12. Embodiment, migration and differentiated borders (1 July, 1030-1200)

**Donna McCormack**

RR: Butler (2004); Chakravorty and Neti (2009)

13. Student presentations, with comments from instructors (1 July, 1300-1630)

**Synnøve Bendixsen, Randi Gressgård, Kari Jegerstedt, Donna McCormack and Gaudencia Mutema**

14. Keynote lecture: Differentiated citizenship: A north/south dialogue (2 July, 0900-1000)

**Amanda Gouws**

RR: Gouws and Stasiulis (2013)

*Abstract: Many countries struggle to accommodate cultural practices that could be construed as harmful to women and that undermine their universal human rights. In the North these cultural practices are often linked to "immigrant communities" that has to be accommodated in democratic rights based societies. In the South, and specifically in Sub-Saharan Africa, cultural practices are protected under customary law that became distorted as a consequence of colonisation. This keynote address will*

*attempt to look at the binary between cultural and rights in the global North and the South in an attempt to see if it can be dislodged.*

15. Student presentations, with comments from instructors (2 July, 1030-1200)  
**Synnøve Bendixsen, Randi Gressgård, Kari Jegerstedt, Donna McCormack and Gaudencia Mutema**
16. Differentiated citizenship and differentiated space (2 July, 1300-1630)  
**Randi Gressgård**  
RR: Mbembe (2003); Ong (2000)
17. Constitutionalism in South Africa: What we can learn from court cases involving violence against women in South Africa? (3 July, 1030-1200)  
**Amanda Gouws**  
RR: Phillips (2009); Mamdani (2000)
18. Panel discussion (3 July, 1300-1630)

### **Social activities**

- Closing party with film screening at SKOK, Allégaten 34 (3 July, 1900-2200)  
Film title: *Children of Men*



<http://kart.gulesider.no/m/arsq5>

### **Reading list (\* indicates required reading)**

Bach, Jonathan (2011): “Modernity and the Urban Imagination in Economic Zones”. *Theory Culture & Society* 28(5): 98–122.

Bair, Jennifer (2010): “On Difference and Capital: Gender and the Globalization of Production”. *Signs* 36(1): 203– 226.

\*Bendixsen, Synnøve (2013): “Becoming Members in the Community of Value: Ethiopian: Irregular Migrants Enacting Citizenship in Norway”. In A. Edelstein and M. Dugan (eds.): *Migration Matters: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Pluralism, Inclusion and Citizenship*. Oxfordshire: Inter-Disciplinary Press.

- \*Butler, Judith (2004): *Precarious Life: The Powers of Mourning and Violence*. London: Verso (Chapter 2, pp. 19–49).
- Casey Edward S (2011): “Border versus Boundary at La Frontera”. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* Vol. 29: 384–398.
- \*Chakravorty, Mrinalini and Neti, Leila (2009): “The Human Recycled: Insecurity in the Transnational Moment”. *Differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 20(2–3): 194–223.
- Cheng, Sealing (2010): “Sexual Protection, Citizenship and Nationhood: Prostituted Women and Migrant Wives in South Korea”. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 37(10): 1627–1648.
- \*Erel, Umut (2011): “Reframing Migrant Mothers as Citizens”. *Citizenship studies* 15 (6–7): 695–709.
- \*Eto, Mikiko (2012): “Reframing Civil Society from Gender Perspectives”. *Journal of Civil Society* 8(2): 101–121.
- \*Goldstein, Donna (1999): “‘Interracial’ Sex and Racial Democracy in Brazil: Twin Concepts?”. *American Anthropologist* 102(3): 563–578.
- \*Gouws, Amanda and Stasiulis, Daiva (2013): “Gender and Multiculturalism – Dislodging the Binary between Universal Human Rights and Culture/Tradition: North/South Perspectives”. *Politikon: South African Journal of Political Studies* 40(1): 1–13.
- \*Jensen, Tina G. (2010): “‘Making Room’: Encompassing Diversity in Denmark”. In Silj, Alessandro (ed.): *European Multiculturalism Revisited*. London: Zed Books. Pp.181–213. <http://site.ebrary.com/lib/bergen/docDetail.action?docID=10430909>
- Kapur Ratna (2007): “The Citizen and the Migrant: Postcolonial Anxieties, Law, and the Politics of Exclusion/Inclusion”. *Theoretical Inquiries in Law* 8(2): 537–569.
- Kofman, Eleonore (2005): “Citizenship, Migration and the Reassertion of National Identity”. *Citizenship Studies* 9(5): 453–467.
- \*Lutz, Helma (2010): “Gender in the Migratory Process”. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 36(10): 1647–1663.
- Macklin, Audrey (2007): “Who Is the Citizen’s Other? Considering the Heft of Citizenship”. *Theoretical Inquiries in Law* 8(2): 333–366.
- \*Mahler, Sarah J. and Pessar, Patricia R. (2006): “Gender Matters: Ethnographers Bring Gender from the Periphery toward the Core of Migration Studies”. *International Migration Review* 40(1): 27–63.
- \*Mamdani, Mahmood, (2000): *Beyond Rights Talk and Culture Talk*. Cape Town: David Philip. (Introduction, pp 1–13).

\*Mbembe, Achille (2003): "Necropolitics" (trans. Libby Meintjes). *Public Culture* 15(1): 11–40.

McNevin, Anne (2006): "Political Belonging in a Neoliberal Era: The Struggle of the Sans-Papiers". *Citizenship Studies* 10(2): 135–151.

Mohanty, Chandra T. (1988): "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses". *Feminist Review* No. 30: 61–88.

Nash, Kate (2009): "Between Citizenship and Human Rights". *Sociology* 43(6): 1067–1083.

\*Ong, Aihwa (2000): "Graduated Sovereignty in Southeast Asia". *Theory, Culture & Society* 17(4): 55–75.

--- (2006): "Mutations in Citizenship". *Theory, Culture & Society* 23(2–3): 499–531.

\*Phillips, Anne (2009): *Multiculturalism without Culture*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. (Chapters 1 and 3, pp. 11–41; 73–99).  
<http://site.ebrary.com/lib/bergen/docDetail.action?docID=10312542>

\*Rydstrøm, Helle (2012): "Gendered Corporeality and Bare Lives: Local Sacrifices and Sufferings during the Vietnam War". *Signs* 37(2): 275–301.

Tadiar, Neferti (2009): "If Not Metaphor ... Sexual Economies Reconsidered". *S&F Online* 7(3). Available at: [http://sfoonline.barnard.edu/sexecon/tadiar\\_01.htm](http://sfoonline.barnard.edu/sexecon/tadiar_01.htm)

Turner, Bryan S. (2007): "The Enclave Society: Towards a Sociology of Immobility". *European Journal of Social Theory* 10(2): 287–303.